

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X

JANNIE PILGRIM, GIOVANNA HENSON,
JESAN SPENCER, BRENDA CURTIS,

Civil Action No.: 07-6618 (CM) (AJP)

Plaintiffs,

-against-

PLAINTIFFS HENSON'S
CURTIS'S, AND
SPENCER'S MEMORANDUM
OF LAW IN OPPOSITION
TO DEFENDANT'S MOTION
FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

THE MCGRAW-HILL COMPANIES, INC.,

Defendant.

-----X

Trial Counsel:
Lawrence Solotoff (LS1356)
Cheryl Solotoff (CS3013)
SOLOTOFF & SOLOTOFF, ESQS.
Plaintiff's Counsel
P.O.Box 4686
Great Neck, New York 11023
Office No. (516) 466-5522
Facsimile No. (516) 466-5562

TO:

Gregory I. Rasin
Elise M. Bloom
Steven D. Hurd
1585 Broadway
New York, New York 10036-8299
Telephone: 212.969.3000
Fax: 212.969.2900
Email: grasin@proskauer.com
Attorneys for Defendant

PAGE NO.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

PRELIMINARY STATEMENT	1
PLAINTIFF HENSON:	2
PLAINTIFF CURTIS	3
PLAINTIFF SPENCER	4
STATEMENT OF FACTS	5
ARGUMENT	5
POINT I FRCP RULE 56 SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARD	5
POINT II THE STANDARD FOR PROVING RACE DISCRIMINATION	7
A. Burden Shifting Standard:	7
B. Standard For Establishing Pretext	8
POINT III: HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT	11
POINT IV: CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE	14
POINT V: MIXED MOTIVE CASE	16
POINT VI: RETALIATION:	16
A. Prima Facie Case of Retaliation	17
B. Material Adversity and Reasonable Employee Standard	18
POINT VII DISCRIMINATION IN HIRING, PROMOTIONS AND TRANSFERS	19
POINT VIII <u>§ 1981</u> AND NYSHRL CLAIMS	20
POINT IX EEOC CHARGE: RELATION BACK THEORY	21
POINT X THE COMPANY.	22

POINT XI	ADMITTED KNOWLEDGE OF THEIR RESPONSIBILITY TO EXERCISE POWERS AND AUTHORITY TO INVESTIGATE DISCRIMINATION COMPLAINTS AND NOT RETALIATE AGAINST THOSE WHO HAD COMPLAINED	22
A.	Background, Policy and Procedure:	
POINT XII	DIRECT EVIDENCE OF DISCRIMINATION AND PLAINTIFFS' COMPLAINTS HENSON'S CLAIMS OF RACE DISCRIMINATION	24
A.	Evidence of HR Department and Corporate "Bad Faith" and Richard Fisher's, Dir. of HR for S&P, Bias Towards Black Employees and Hostile Comments as it effected Henson and Pilgrim:	24
B.	Proof of Pretext and Direct Evidence of Race Discrimination; and "Bad Faith"	25
PART XIII:	HENSON SUFFERED RETALIATION	29
POINT XIV	SPENCER'S CLAIMS OF RACE DISCRIMINATION AND HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT	34
POINT XV	SPENCER'S CLAIMS OF RETALIATION AND CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE	40
POINT XVI	CURTIS'S CLAIMS OF RACE DISCRIMINATION AND RETALIATION POST-TERMINATION	43
A.	Direct Evidence of Stadnyk's Bias against Black Employees:	43
B.	Direct Evidence of Stadnyk's Bias Against Curtis Post-Employment The Defendant's Retaliation Against Her:	46
POINT XVII	CURTIS'S APPLICATIONS TO MCGRAW-HILL FOLLOWING HER TERMINATION: AND DENIAL OF RE-EMPLOYMENT	49
CONCLUSION		50

TABLE OF AUTHORITES

CASES	Pages
<i>Abdu-Brisson v. Delta Air Lines, Inc.</i> , 239 F.3d 456, 468 (2d Cir.2000).	10,13
<i>Alicea Rosado v. Garcia Santiago</i> , 562 F.2d 114 (1st Cir.1977);	16
<i>Anderson v. City of Bessemer City, N.C.</i> , 470 U.S. 564, 105 S. Ct. 1504 (1985).	19
<i>Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc.</i> , 477 U.S. 242, 248, 106 S.Ct. 2505 (1986)	5,6
<i>Belfi v. Prendergast</i> , 191 F.3d 129, 135 (2d Cir.1999).	7
<i>Bourque v. Powell Electrical Mfg. Co.</i> , 617 F.2d 61 (5th Cir.1980).	16
Brown v. Henderson 257 F.3d 246 (2d. Cir. 2001)	
<i>Burlington Northern & Santa Fe Railway Co., v White</i> , 548 U.S. 53, 126 S.Ct. 2405 (2006)	18,34
<i>Carerro v. New York City Housing Auth.</i> , 890 F.2d 569, 579 (2d Cir.1989)	12,38
<i>Carson v. Bethlehem Steel Corp.</i> , 82 F.3d 157, 158 (7th Cir.1996)	13
<i>Celotex Corp. v. Catrett</i> , 477 U.S. 317, 323, 106 S.Ct. 2548 (1986)	6
<i>Chambers v. TRM Copy Centers Corp.</i> , 43 F.3d 29, 37 (2d Cir.1994).	11
<i>Chertkova v. Conn. Gen. Life Ins. Co.</i> , 92 F.3d 81, 89 (2d Cir.1996)).	15
<i>Choudhury v. Polytechnic Institute of New York</i> , 735 F.2d 38, 39-40, 43 (2d Cir.1984);	21
<i>Cifra v. General Electric Company</i> , 252 F.3d 205, 85 F.E.P.Cases 1664 (2d Cir. 2001);	6
<i>City of Los Angeles, Dep't of Water and Power v. Manhart</i> ,	13
435 U.S. 702, 98 S.Ct. 1370, (1978).	
<i>Connecticut v. Teal</i> , 457 U.S. 440, 453-54, 102 S.Ct. 2525, 73 L.Ed.2d 130 (1982)	13
<i>Cronin v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i> , 46 F.3d 196, 203 (2d Cir.1995)	6,9,11,40
<i>Davis v. Dalla Area Rapid Transit</i> , 383 F.3d 309, 318 (5 th Cir. 2004)	20
<i>Delaware & Hudson Railway Co. v. Consolidated Rail Corp.</i> , 902 F.2d 174 (2d Cir. 1990)	6

<i>Deravin v. Kerik</i> , 335 F.3d 195 (2d Cir.2003)	21,22
<i>Ellerth</i> , 524 U.S., at 752, 118 S.Ct. 2257.	14
<i>Epstein v. Kalvin-Miller International, Inc.</i> , 100 F.Supp.2d 230 (S.D.N.Y. 2000).	8
<i>Feingold v. New York</i> , 366 F.3d 138, 152 (2d Cir.2004)	9,16,25
Fisher v. Vassar College, 114 F.3d 1332, 74 F.E.P.109 (2d Cir.1997) <i>cert. denied</i> , 522 U.S. 1075, 118 S.Ct. 851, 139 L.Ed.2d 752 (1998)	8
<i>Francis v. Chemical Banking Corp.</i> , 62 F.Supp.2d 948 (E.D.N.Y.1999), <i>aff'd</i> 213 F.3d 626 (2d Cir.2000).	21
<i>Gallo v. Prudential Residential Servs., Ltd. P'ship</i> , 22 F.3d 1219, (2d Cir.1994)	7,11
<i>Garone v. United Parcel Servs., Inc.</i> , 2001 WL 984914, at *2 (E.D.N.Y. July 12, 2001);	21
<i>Goenaga v. March of Dimes Birth Defects Found.</i> , 51 F.3d 14, 18 (2d Cir.1995)	6,10
<i>Gordon v. New York City Bd. of Educ.</i> , 232 F.3d 111, 117 (2d Cir.2000)).	17,34
<i>Gregory v. Daly</i> , 243 F.3d 687, 701 (2d Cir.2001)	12,13,14,17,38,39
<i>Griggs v. Duke Power Co.</i> , 401 U.S. 424, 91 S.Ct. 849 (1971)	20,29
<i>Hall v. New York Hosp.</i> , 2003 WL 22902125, at *3 (S.D.N.Y. Dec. 8, 2003)	21
<i>Harris v. Forklift Systems, Inc.</i> , 510 U.S. 17, 21, 114 S.Ct. 367, 370, (1993);	11,12
<i>Hawkins v. 1115 Legal Serv. Care</i> , 163 F.3d 684 (2d Cir.1998).	21
<i>Hopkins v. Electronic Data Sys. Corp.</i> , 196 F.3d 655, 662 (6th Cir.1999);	10,25
James v. New York Racing Ass'n, 233 F.3d 149 (2d Cir. 2000).	8
<i>Jessamy v. City of New Rochelle, New York</i> , 292 F.Supp.2d 498, 511 n. 15 (S.D.N.Y.2003).	20
<i>Kessler v. Westchester County Dept. of Social Services</i> , 461 F.3d 199 (2d. Cir. 2006)	
<i>Kirsch v. Fleet Street Ltd.</i> , 148 F.3d 149, 161-62 (2d Cir.1998)	15,42
<i>Koski v. Standex International Corp.</i> , 307 F.3d 672, 678 (7 th Cir.2002).	16

<i>Legnani v. Alitalia Linee Aeree Italiane, S.P.A.</i> , 274 F.3d 683, 686 (2d Cir.2001)).	21
<i>Loeb v. Textron, Inc.</i> , 600 F.2d 1003, 1012 n. 6 (1st Cir.1979).	11
<i>Lopez v. S.B. Thomas, Inc.</i> , 831 F.2d 1184, 1188 (2d Cir.1987)	15,21,42
<i>Luciano v. Olsten Corporation</i> , 110 F.3d 210, 218 (2d. Cir. 1997).	16,29
<i>McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. Green</i> , 411 U.S. 792, 93 S.Ct. 1817 (1973);	7,8,9
<i>Meiri v. Dacon</i> , 759 F.2d 989, 998 (2d Cir.1985).	7
<i>Meritor Savings Bank, FSB v. Vinson</i> , 477 U.S. 57, 65, 106 S.Ct. 2399, 2404- 05 (1986).	11,12
<i>North Shore Univ. Hospital v. Rosa</i> , 86 N.Y.2d 413, 633 N.Y.S.2d 462 (N.Y.1995)	8
<i>Oncale v. Sundowner Offshore Servs., Inc.</i> , 523 U.S. 75, 78, 118 S.Ct. 998 (1998);	12,38
<i>Padilla v. Metro-North Commuter RR.</i> , 92 F.3d 117, 123 (2d Cir.1996)	11,40
<i>Parrish v. Sollecito</i> , 258 F.Supp.2d 264, 268 (S.D.N.Y.2003)	17,34
<i>Pena v. Brattleboro Retreat</i> , 702 F.2d 322, 325-26 (2d Cir.1983).	15
<i>Pennsylvania State Police v. Suders</i> , 542 U.S. 129, 124 S.Ct. 2342, 2352 (2004)	14,15
<i>Perry v. Ethan Allen, Inc.</i> , 115 F.3d 143, 149 (2d Cir.1997).	12
<i>Petrosino v. Bell Atlantic</i> , 385 F.3d 210C.A.2 (N.Y.),2004.	15,42
<i>Pivirotto v. Innovative Sys. Inc.</i> , 191 F.3d 344, 354 (3d Cir.1999).	13
<i>Ralkin v. New York City Transit Auth.</i> , 62 F. Supp.2d 989, 997 (E.D.N.Y. 1999)	10
<i>Ramseur v. Chase Manhattan Bank</i> , 865 F.2d 460, 465 (2d Cir. 1996)	5
<i>Reeves v. Sanderson Plumbing Products, Inc.</i> , 530 U.S. 133, 148, 120 S.Ct. 2097 (2000).	10
<i>Richardson v. New York State Dep't of Correctional Serv.</i> , 180 F.3d 426, (2d Cir.1999);	12
<i>Rodriguez v. City of New York</i> , 72 F.3d 1051, 1061 (2d Cir. 1955).	8
<i>Santiago-Ramos v. Centennial P.R. Wireless Corp.</i> , 217 F.3d 46, 56 (1st Cir.2000).	10,25
<i>Schiano v. Quality Payroll Systems, Inc.</i> , 445 F.3d 597, 609 (2d Cir.2006);	20

<i>Schnabbel v. Abramson</i> , 232 F.3d 83, 90 (2d Cir.2000).	10,29
<i>Schwapp v. Town of Avon</i> , 118 F.3d 106, 110 (2d Cir.1997)	7
<i>Sorlucco v. New York City Police Dept.</i> , 888 F.2d 4, 6-7 (2d Cir.1989);	20
<i>Stern v. Trs. of Columbia Univ.</i> , 131 F.3d 305, 312 (2d Cir.1997)).	9,25
<i>Texas Department of Community Affairs v. Burdine.</i> , 450 U.S. 248, 101 S.Ct. 1089 (1981);	9,11,39
<i>Trans Sport, Inc. v. Starter Sportswear</i> , 964 F.2d 186, 188 (2d Cir. 1992).	5
<i>Victory v. Hewlett-Packard Company</i> , 34 F.Supp.2d 809 (E.D.N.Y.1999).	6
<i>Watson v. Fort Worth Bank & Trust</i> , 487 U.S. 977, 108 S.Ct. 2777 (1988)	20,29
<i>Webber v. International Paper Company</i> , 417 F.3d 229, 237 (1 st Cir. 2005).	10,25
<i>Whidbee v. Garzarelli Food Specialties, Inc.</i> , 223 F.3d 62, 69 (2d Cir.2000);	12,20,21
<i>Williams v. County of Westchester</i> , 171 F.3d 98, 100 (2d Cir.1999).	12
<i>Williams v. R.H.Donnelly Corp.</i> , 368 F.3d 123, 127 (2d Cir. 2004).	20
<i>Wimmer v. Suffolk County Police Dept.</i> , 176 F.3d 125, 136 (2d Cir.1999)).	17
<i>Woodcock v. Montefiore Med. Ctr.</i> , 2002 WL 403601, at *5-6 (E.D.N.Y.2002);	21
<i>Young v. Southwestern Savings and Loan Assn.</i> , 509 F.2d 140, 144 (5th Cir.1975).	16
<i>Zelnik v. Fashion Inst. of Tech.</i> , 464 F.3d 217, 227 (2d Cir.2006).	

TABLE OF STATUTES

Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964,

42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2(a)(1).

42 U.S.C. § 2000e-2(m).

§703(a) and §704(a) of Title VII]

42 U.S.C. §1981.

OTHER AUTHORITIES

Fed. R. Civ. P. (FRCP) Rule 56